A Study of Spiritual Formation and Transformative Learning of Students with

Implications for Chistian Higher Education Institutions.

By Dr. Nishanth Thomas, Professor of Biblical Studies and Dean of Academic Success

Abstract

This study demonstrated that integrating transformative learning into Christian Higher Education Institutions (CHEIs) for the purpose of enhancing Spiritual Formation has the potential to offer tremendous benefits.

Mezirow's theory of transformative learning, though prominent and integrated into multiple domains, has a significant gap, which has been identified by multiple theorists: the lack of integration of spirituality. The works of Dirkx (1997, 1998) and Tisdell (2003) recommend the incorporation of spirituality into transformative learning. Studying spirituality is fraught with problems because the U.S. has shifted from a Christian worldview to a multi-religious understanding of spirituality (McLaughlin, 2015).

This study also identified three major gaps pertaining to Christian Spiritual Formation at CHEIs and demonstrated how to address these gaps. These gaps include: the lack of a proper and comprehensive definition for Spiritual Formation that is utilized consistently across CHEIs, the lack of holistic methodologies used for implementing Spiritual Formation institution-wide, and the lack of a comprehensive Spiritual Formation assessment (CCCU, 2010).

CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty should be encouraged to integrate Transformative Learning Theory (TLT) whenever appropriate and as is biblically and theologically congruent. Transformative learning in CHEIs is understood to be "a complex personal change process where cognitive, emotional, evaluative, social, and spiritual processes [work] together" (Weinski, 2006). Transformation specifically at CHEIs occurred through (a) transformational relationships, (b) transformational spaces, (c) transformational pedagogy, (d) transformational posture, (e) transformational activities, and (f) transformational events. This study unpacked several key concepts and practical ideas associated with these six components. Transformational learning within CHEIs has both a divine element and a physical presence component. Chan (2008) states that transformational postures permit students to engage in transformational pedagogy by entering transformational relationships and spaces, and encounter the work of the Holy Spirit in their lives. From a theological integration standpoint, all six of these ideas were involved in the formation of the New Testament church (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37).

This study explored strategies for utilizing transformative learning principles to spiritually form students within CHEIs. CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty could be trained to utilize these methods and findings to assist with spiritually forming students

Impact of Christian Higher Education Institutions

Christian Higher Education Institutions (henceforth referred to as "CHEIs") play a crucial role on a local, national, and global level. Together, the Association of Biblical Higher Education (ABHE) and the Council for Christian Colleges and Universities (CCCU) institutions account for most of the evangelical Christian institutions across North America, in addition to a few overseas institutions.

The ABHE's goal is "Advancing biblical higher education for Kingdom impact" (ABHE, 2024). The ABHE's mission is help institutions be biblical, transformational, experiential, and missional (ABHE, 2020). The ABHE serves around 158 institutions in the U.S. and Canada, with around 66,677 students currently enrolled in ABHE schools (ABHE, 2024). The ABHE is also a Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA) recognized accrediting agency (ABHE, 2024).

The mission of CCCU institutions is: "The CCCU's mission is to advance the cause of Christ-centered higher education and to help our institutions transform lives by faithfully relating scholarship and service to biblical truth" (CCCU, 2024). The CCCU is composed of 185 institutions, 520,000 students, 90,000 full-time employees, 3,600,000 alumni worldwide and 2,000,000 alumni in the U.S. workforce (CCCU, 2024; CCCU, 2018).

Based on an economic impact study that was done, it was determined that CCCU institutions provided $60 billion in annual economic impact and, on average, provided $5 in institutional aid for every $1 in federal grants received by students (CCCU, 2018). Additionally, when compared to students attending secular higher education institutions,

CCCU students were also more likely to be first-generation college students and were less likely to come from high earning families (CCCU, 2018). Local communities tremendously benefit from the wide range of programs offered by these institutions because of resources, campus space, and services that are open to the local community (CCCU, 2018). CCCU students are prominently represented in the human services fields because their goal is to serve God by serving others (CCCU, 2018).

CHEI leaders can and should promote these unique findings to their constituents and national leaders to demonstrate the important role played by CHEIs in helping society not just from a spiritual standpoint, but also from both an economic and social standpoint.

Introduction to the Problem

Christian Colleges within the world of Higher Education are unique and play several critical roles such as, but not limited to, Christian formation, integration of faith and learning, character development, leadership growth, and vocational training. The two main categories of undergraduate institutions that fit under the evangelical umbrella of Christian colleges are, in most cases, either Association of Biblical Higher Education (ABHE) accredited institutions or Council for Christian Colleges & Universities (CCCU) member institutions.

The goal of both ABHE and CCCU institutions is to foster the Spiritual Formation of the student body. This is what ultimately separates a Christ-centered institution from a secular degree-granting institution. The expression "Spiritual Formation" is rich, lacks a proper definition that is agreed upon by all evangelicals, and therefore tends to have limitations regarding its assessment (CCCU, 2010). The CCCU

report on Spiritual Formation asks the question, "How are we doing in fulfilling the religious dimension of our mission" (CCCU, 2010, p. XI)? The response hinges on determining if CHEIs are spiritually forming and morally developing their students and, if so, determining how this can be measured. In the past, CHEIs have not been mandated to prove that they are indeed completing the Spiritual Formation component of their mission. However, CHEIs cannot anticipate that the religious exemption to employ only professing disciples of Christ will remain if they cannot prove that they are completing their mission (CCCU, 2010). Consequently, in our present-day atmosphere of community accountability, there will likely be mounting requests for CHEIs to prove that they are accomplishing their mission. Therefore, if CHEIs "…do not or cannot demonstrate success, according to research accepted by a secular and skeptical public, such failure could lead the public to conclude that it should not grant the religious exemption because the purpose for the exemption" is not being accomplished (CCCU, 2010, p. XI). Thus, it is pivotal for CHEIs to define, understand, implement, and assess Spiritual Formation institution-wide.

Research Questions

For this study on Spiritual Formation in Christian Higher Education (henceforth referred to as CHE) through the lens of Transformative Learning Theory, three key research questions, along with one implication question, were explored:

1. In what ways do Christian Higher Education Institutions currently spiritually form their students?

2. In what ways does transformative learning take place at CHEIs?

3. What are the best practices in Spiritual Formation that have overlap with best practices for transformative learning at CHEIs?

4. The key implication question was: How can Christian colleges (specifically CHEI leaders, faculty, and student development officers) create spaces for Spiritual Formation to occur in the curricular and co-curricular setting by utilizing Transformative Learning Theory?

The definitions of Transformative Learning Theory and Spiritual Formation will follow in the next sections.

Implications and Recommendations for Educational Ministry

This section will discuss the key implications and recommendations for Christian educational ministry. This section is divided into three parts. The first part of this section defines Transformative Learning Theory and Spiritual Formation followed by addressing key trends shaping Christian Higher Education as it pertains to Spiritual Formation. The second section will discuss Spiritual Formation in general, overarching formation concepts for institutions, and overarching concepts for integrating transformative learning at CHEIs. The third and final section will comprehensively address, at length, the implication question for this study through summarizing key findings of this study.

Transformative Learning Theory

Transformative Learning Theory was proposed by Jack Mezirow with the goal of comprehending and systematizing how adult meaning making took place as a byproduct of their experience (Mezirow, 1991). Mezirow (2000) defines Transformative Learning Theory as:

…the process by which we transform our taken-for-granted frames of

references (meaning perspectives, habits of mind, mind-sets) to make them more inclusive, discriminating, open, emotionally capable of change, and reflective so that they may generate beliefs and opinions that will prove more true or justified to guide action. (2000, p. 8)

Though there are ten key phases to TLT, they have been condensed into four broader phases: disorienting dilemma, critical reflection, rational dialogue, and action (Glisczinski, 2007).

Definition and Gaps in Spiritual Formation at CHEIs

The three major gaps at CHEIs in terms of Spiritual Formation, based on a literature review, were as follows: The lack of a proper and comprehensive definition for Spiritual Formation that is utilized consistently across CHEIs, the lack of holistic methodologies used for implementing Spiritual Formation institution-wide, and the lack of comprehensive Spiritual Formation assessment (CCCU, 2010).

The definition of Spiritual Formation created by the CCCU was used for this study and the researcher hopes that this definition can be adopted comprehensively to ensure consistency in Spiritual Formation across institutions. Spiritual Formation "…is the biblically guided process in which people are being transformed into the likeness of Christ by the power of the Holy Spirit within the faith community in order to love and serve God and others" (CCCU, 2010, p. 13). The CCCU definition also established 16 definitional elements that operate as indices to this definition. These indices are listed below:

1. God-initiated, Christ-centered, Holy Spirit-led.
2. Rooted in and guided by Holy Scripture.
3. Informed by historic Christian tradition.
4. Fosters an ongoing awareness of the human condition, personally and universally.
5. Affirms repentance as evidenced by change of behavior.
6. Aims at love of God and others.
7. Motivates to self-less service.

8. A holistic developmental process, which involves mind, body, and soul.
9. Communal and relational in nature.
10. Embraces practice of various spiritual disciplines.
11. Involves a spiritual/social ecology.
12. Increasing evidence of appropriating the character of Christ and the fruit of the Spirit.
13. Supports the local and global church.
14. Advances gospel witness, biblical justice and reconciliation.
15. Renews and transforms the mind.
16. Expresses itself in positive character qualities and behavior (CCCU, 2010, p. 13).

These 16 indices should serve as a guiding light for CHEIs to ensure that programs and practices across an institution align with these dimensions.

The third gap related to a lack of assessment could be resolved by CHEIs utilizing instruments for assessing Spiritual Formation, such as the Spiritual Transformation Inventory (STI), an instrument that was created by Dr. Todd Hall. The STI is by far one of the most broadly utilized spiritual assessment tools among Christian colleges and universities and Bible institutes and has established reliability and validity. The five key domains for the inventory included: Connecting to Self & Others, Connecting to God, Connecting to Spiritual Community, Connecting to Spiritual Practices, and Connecting to God's Kingdom (Hall, 2015 as cited in Barkley, 2017). The STI also measures many of the 16 indices in the CCCU Spiritual Formation definition.

The 16 indices utilized in the CCCU Spiritual Formation definition could also be used for constructing a new instrument. Other instruments could potentially be created through a partnership between the ABHE and the CCCU, but it would have to be a comprehensive effort to ensure that it assesses formation holistically and is strong in both reliability and validity. Such instruments would provide necessary data to CHEI leaders and stakeholders to strengthen current institution-wide efforts, train staff members and faculty, and build new Spiritual Formation initiatives. Institutions would also have to

receive training in terms of how to use instruments well and review the data they receive

so they can utilize it meaningfully.

Key Trends Shaping CHEIs and Spiritual Formation

There are several key trends shaping CHEIs that CHEI leaders, faculty, and

student development staff need to be aware of and account for (Barna Group, 2017,

2018). The top nine trends are listed below:

- Demographic: the increase of non-traditional students, Generation Z students, minority students, and women.
- Social: colleges are now the place were transition between adolescence and adulthood takes place at for the traditional age student population as the incoming college student will go through key life decisions later on in life.
- Economic: rising education costs plus financial pressure on families makes attending colleges challenging. Also, the increase in advocacy for free tuition can negatively affect small private CHEIs.
- Vocational: there has been a massive shift in the vocational landscape towards multiple careers, freelance opportunities, and short-term work. Also, fewer students are enrolling in ministry-related programs, there is more competition for the ministry-minded students, and there are a reduced number of pastoral and ministry positions. These are the present realities.
- Institutional: information transfer has tremendously changed because of the rise of the Internet, and colleges are no longer seen as the gatekeepers to accessing knowledge.
- Legal: Christian institutions that hold historically scriptural positions on marriage and human sexuality are going to run into potential challenges with state and federal governments especially as it pertains to aid.
- Digital: the digital world requires new, more complex, and nuanced approaches to teaching and formation as students are living in a hyper-connected world.
- Moral: society's moral center has shifted away from the external authority of the Bible and Church to the internal world of oneself being the arbiter of right and wrong.
- Spiritual: the exponential rise of the category of "nones" (people who are religiously unaffiliated) in the general population (Barna Group, 2017, 2018).

Many students now enter theological education with an incomplete understanding

of spiritual disciplines, a disintegrated worldview, and a broken understanding of

Spiritual Formation. Sadly, reasons such developing moral character and Spiritual

Formation were the least prioritized values for those considering CHEIs (Barna Group, 2017, 2018).

Another major trend and concern is that Western society is creating a faith-repellent environment (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). Western culture (specifically the American culture) has shifted from Jerusalem to Digital Babylon (both these terms are used metaphorically). There has been a digital colonization of the world because while "screens inform and connect, they also distract and entertain" (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). The average young adult (aged 15–23) spends ten times more time using technology as compared to time spent consuming spiritual content (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). Young adults have become "screen disciples", while loneliness, depression, cynicism, and anxiety, in conjunction with the constant "fear of missing out", have continued to increase. Digital Babylon is a virus that has hijacked Christian formation (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). What is even more troubling is that Big Tech has the power to guide information and targeted marketing advertisements in ways that were never possible before, in order to increase screen addiction. CHEI leaders, faculty, and staff need to be aware of and address these major issues in order for formation to succeed within the framework of CHEIs.

All of these trends pose several unique challenges and opportunities to Spiritual Formation and CHEIs. CHEI leaders and CHEI organizations like the ABHE and the CCCU need to be intentional, coordinated, and strategic about addressing these topics in order for Christian Higher Education to continue flourishing and thriving, and to fulfill its missions.

Overarching Spiritual Formation Concepts for CHEIs

This section contains overarching Spiritual Formation concepts that CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty need to be aware of, though this section is specifically for CHEI leaders.

The goal of discipleship should be "developing Jesus followers who are resiliently faithful in the face of cultural coercion and who live a vibrant life in the Spirit" (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, pp. 29–30). Resilient Disciples accounted for only four million 18-29 year old U.S. adults (around 10% of the population this age) and were those who followed the basics of biblical faith, which involved being in a community of believers, having a personal commitment to Christ, professing belief in His death and resurrection, affirmation that the Word of God is inspired, and having a sincere desire to make a broader impact in society with their faith (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, pp. 31-32). These numbers are troubling and have tremendous implications for CHEIs in general and churches in specific. This implies that churches and CHEIs are struggling to provide adequate formation and need to critically and carefully rethink how to form resilient and thoughtful disciples.

Some studies have demonstrated that students attending Christian institutions choose to do so because they value the Spiritual Formation perspective and the integration of faith and learning (Morris et al., 2003; Barkley, 2017). Students who were more satisfied with the spiritual climate were more likely to persist and graduate than their peers, and this increased retention at CHEIs (Morris et al., 2003). Ma (2003) demonstrated that the very nature of being in a Christian college environment was helpful to formation for 97.1% of the student population. Also, it is crucial to remember that both adult learners from Christian faith traditions and non-Christians benefitted from the

emotional support, Spiritual Formation, biblical teaching, faith-based principles, and devotional practices offered by CHEIs (Decker, 2017). Although CHEI leaders are succeeding in creating environments of formation, much work still needs to be done to form resilient disciples.

CCCU institutions (when compared to secular institutions), while playing a critical role in strengthening the faith of born-again college students, also helped in converting those who did not identify as born-again by their four-year term at a CCCU institution, including Black and Asian students (Railsback, 2005, 2006).

Theological institutions have the challenge of integrating an intellectually rigorous curriculum with integrity and appropriate praxis and also simultaneously strengthening the Spiritual Formation of its students (Naidoo, 2011). Consequently, without institution wide commitment to formation, Spiritual Formation initiatives do not succeed (Naidoo, 2011). CHEI leaders need to be both intentional and persistent in order to spiritually form students, in addition to performing institution-wide assessments (Naidoo, 2011).

Integrating Spiritual Formation requires "intelligence, instruction, and the discipline of practice" (Edwards, 1980). To begin this process, CHEI leaders need to ensure that their institutions have one chief officer in charge of formation who is supported by other CHEI leaders, is willing to work with the entire institution to develop institution-wide formation, and formation needs to be modeled by all CHEI leaders (Edwards, 1980). Additionally, faculty, staff, and students should engage and play give-and-take roles in the formation process (this will be discussed in detail in future sections). Schools also need to focus on creating spaces (individual's role) for spiritual

transformation (God's role) to occur while intentionally fostering community (Edwards, 1980).

Services for Spiritual Formation need to be strengthened in CHEIs (Ma, 2003; Naidoo, 2011). Consequently, CHEIs should offer deliberate services for learners, institute clear and realistic expectations, be boldly Christian in identity, and create and sustain transformative educational practices in order to assist students (Decker, 2017). The types of services required will be described at length in the next sections. Spiritual Formation also requires collaborative and communitarian elements (Naidoo, 2011). Additionally, student insights and feedback should be utilized in creating holistically integrated environments for spiritual growth (Naidoo, 2011).

The Higher Education Research Institute (HERI, 2003) study demonstrated that religious and spiritual beliefs and practices played a major role in a student's psychological and physical well-being. Astin et al. (2011) also suggests integrating components from religiosity and spirituality into different regions of college life. CHEI leaders would potentially benefit from being aware of, reviewing, and incorporating national surveys such as HERI and the Cooperative Institutional Research Program (CIRP).

Diversity was a crucial component in thriving and tremendously helped with transformational learning. The presence of female faculty members was critical for formation in female students enrolled in their programs (Wade, 2004; Wollert, 2004). Richardson (2017) shares that having a diverse group of faculty and administrators integrated with the unique ethos of CHEIs was necessary for the thriving of religious minorities. This means CHEI leaders should be intentional about hiring diverse staff and

faculty, and about cultivating a diverse student body, as both play a vital role in Spiritual Formation.

In conclusion to this section, CHEI leaders need to go beyond just sharing Spiritual Formation in mission and vision statements and integrate it as the core of who they are and what they hope to accomplish. Spiritual Formation is indispensable to the survival of the church because cultural Christianity in western nations will not be able to survive the coming cultural darkness in which the world may no longer tolerate Christians or Christian beliefs (Barna Group, 2017, 2018). CHEI leaders need to do a better job of communicating their value to the world in order to continually serve a hurting world well and to spiritually form resilient disciples. CHEI leaders need to start off with the "why," followed by the "how," and followed by the "what" (Barna Group, 2017 and 2018). The "why" means putting ministry, formation of future leaders, and mission at the center of everything that CHEIs do. The "how" is accomplished by articulating an attainable and practical mechanism to accomplish the mission, while the "what" is being specific about what the school is trying to accomplish (Barna Group, 2017, 2018).

Overarching Concepts for Integrating Transformative Learning

This section will cover the overarching concepts for integrating transformative learning into CHEIs holistically and comprehensively. The prominent implication of the results of this study is that utilizing ideas from Transformative Learning Theory in the framework of CHEIs has the potential to tremendously enhance the teaching and learning process. The review of literature also implies that the probable negative impacts of using

TLT are minimal. CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty can resolve any challenges caused as a byproduct of integration through training, wisdom, support, and mentoring.

A key general recommendation is that CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty should be encouraged to integrate TLT whenever appropriate and as is biblically and theologically congruent. Following are suggested practical recommendations for a holistic integration of Transformative Learning Theory within CHEIs that might result in deeper levels of Spiritual Formation. Each of the next sections will focus on four key groups, assuming that the relevant recommendations and implications are applicable to these groups. The first group will be CHEI leaders, the second is staff helping with student development, the third is the faculty, and the fourth is the students themselves.

To begin, it must be noted that transformational learning within CHEIs has two components: a divine element and a physical presence (Chan, 2008; Tran, 2011; Wang, 2015; McLaughlin, 2014). Ntamushobora (2012) argues that the means and reason for transformation was "the other", which included professors, colleagues, guest speakers, self-introspection, the Holy Spirit's guidance, reading course material, and facing perspective-challenging facts. CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty need to be aware that transformation occurred in three dimensions: "(a) psychological, (b) convictional, and (c) behavioral" (Roberts, 2009, pg. 90). Transformative learning in CHEIs was understood to be "a complex personal change process where cognitive, emotional, evaluative, social, and spiritual processes worked together" (Weinski, 2006, p. v). Mwangi (2017) notes that the following 3 dimensions were transformed: "social life, family life, and priorities" (p. 277).

The following six domains need to be transformed - "Thought (images, concepts, judgments, inferences), Feeling (sensation, emotion), Choice (will, decision, character), Body (action, interaction with the physical world), Social Context (personal and structural relations to others) and Soul (the factor that integrates all of the above)" (Willard, 2002, p. 30). This means any meaningful attempt for transformational Spiritual Formation to occur requires the integration of all six of these components.

A key finding that summarizes the indispensable components brought up in the empirical studies done on Transformative Learning Theory at CHEIs and frames the future sections is that transformative learning specifically at CHEIs occurred through six integral dimensions: (a) transformational posture (b) transformational pedagogy (c) transformational spaces (d) transformational relationships (e) transformational activities and (f) transformational events (Chan, 2008; Tjioe, 2012). Note that these dimensions are not listed sequentially and occasionally have overlap with each other. Additionally, each of these components will be described in its own section. However, from a theological integration standpoint, all these six ideas were involved in the formation of the New Testament church (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37). Each one of these is visible in the church in Acts: Transformational posture (included having hearts of prayer, glad and sincere hearts, united hearts, and hearts of radical generosity); transformational pedagogy (included the apostles' powerful teaching); transformational spaces (included meeting spaces of temple courts and homes); transformational relationships (involved daily fellowship and communion that united believers as the body of Christ); transformational activities (included communion and eating together, praising God, and sharing wealth); and transformational events (included radical lifestyle centered on Jesus and community,

God's grace, Holy Spirit, and signs and wonders performed by the apostles). CHEI leaders can intentionally model their institutions around these social science and scriptural ideals to promote and support transformation.

The next section will describe the previously mentioned six categories, along with classifying distinct Spiritual Formation concepts under each of those categories.

Transformational Posture

A transformational posture was a prerequisite for both the formation process to begin and also for the formation process to be successfully completed. Chan (2008) describes a transformational posture as an attitude that "prepares a student for transformational learning" (Chan, 2008, p. 124). Chan (2008) goes further by stating that transformational postures "allow students to engage in transformational relationships, enter transformational spaces, and experience the work of the Holy Spirit in their lives" (Chan, 2008, p. 147). From a New Testament church standpoint, a transformational posture included having hearts of prayer, hearts that lived in God's joy, hearts that were sincere, hearts that were united, and hearts that knew and practiced radical generosity in everything (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37).

Formative Postures and Character Virtues. Students should be taught to model postures that pave the pathway for reflection, being secure in one's own identity, self-discipline, sincerely yearning and following "good or the eternal things", and being expectant for the Holy Spirit to work (Chan, 2008, p. 114). Tjioe (2012) noted some additional elements for students to incorporate, such as humility, persistence, willingness to resolve conflicts, thriving devotional times, willingness to learn and grow, willingness to submit to God's guidance, and responding to God's word.

A transformational posture also involves teaching and modeling: truth seeking, honesty, wisdom, faith (trust), hope, open-mindedness, self-criticality, non-defensiveness, ardor, letting agape love for God and others be the center of all things, unconditional obedience and surrender to God's will, inward rightness, practicing spiritual disciplines, vigilance, fortitude, loyalty to God, and allegiance to God's vision for the world as the main focus of life (Moreland, 2012; Willard, 2009).

Schroeder (2013) proposes following Jesus's unique formation strategy based on the Gospel of Luke. The three-step sequential process is about having the right posture and attitude for Spiritual Formation to take place. Firstly, learning kingdom values (which included teachability, flexibility, humility, compassion, and integrity), based on Luke 5-6; secondly, learning kingdom mission (which included selflessness, intensity, courage, dependency, transparency, and contentment), based on Luke 9-12; and thirdly, learning kingdom leadership (which included trustworthiness, accountability, alertness, and servanthood), based on Luke 16-22.

CHEI leaders and faculty need to teach and demonstrate these attitudes and character virtues. Faculty have the unique ability to both model and teach these postures by integrating them regularly into the classroom context. All disciplines should integrate these key ideas whenever possible to enable students to develop these postures. Chapels and other student development events could also address these ideas and provide practical skills for incorporating these postures. For instance, tips on humility should be integrated in curricular and co-curricular activities for repeated reinforcement. Another idea is to ensure that these key postures are taught in conjunction with practical application tips at a freshman seminar.

Spiritual Disciplines. Spiritual disciplines were both a venue for transformation and also helped with the ongoing integration of transformative perspectives (Mwangi, 2017; Tuttle, 2000; Wang, 2015). Spiritual disciplines could also fill in a gap in Mezirow's theory and TLT literature -- the lack of discussion about sustaining revised transformed perspectives long-term (Mwangi, 2017). Even though spiritual disciplines could fit in the category of transformational pedagogy, they were placed in this section because spiritual disciplines can assist students with preparing their heart to have a receptive attitude that permits transformative learning.

> A spiritual discipline is (1) a repeated bodily-spirit-Spirit activity, (2) the doing of which is in our power, (3) which forms a habit over time and repetition, (4) that opens our heart to the work of the Holy Spirit, (5) who transforms us spiritually, that is, in cooperation with our spirit, fills us with His presence and by so doing, in union, conforms us more and more to the image of Christ. (Coe, 2000, p. 1)

Prayer is a central dimension for personal and corporate revival linked to transformation. A posture of prayer means expecting God to do the unexpected; praying regularly; responding swiftly to God's guidance; responding to God through prayer, confession, intercession or thanksgiving; and, finally, uniting with like-minded colleagues in both prayer and action (McLaughlin, 2014). Resilient disciples practiced worship as a lifestyle, read Scripture regularly, experienced the reality of God's presence, and became regular attendees at a church (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). Foster's (2012) book, *Celebration of Discipline: The Path to Spiritual Growth,* and *The Spiritual Disciplines Handbook,* written by Adele Calhoun (2015), can be helpful resources for CHEI leaders, student development staff, and faculty to learn about this topic. Spiritual disciplines and prayer can be integrated into a freshman seminar in addition to Spiritual Formation classes. All faculty can also be intentionally trained to have a brief devotional

in class, which integrates a spiritual discipline every week sequentially across curriculum. Spiritual disciplines can help students integrate their learning at deeper levels and so the appropriate spiritual discipline should be integrated whenever applicable with assignments. This means, for instance, a business class could have a service project to help the community in order to learn business principles, while also integrating the spiritual discipline of service. Another example could be that a psychology class could teach about scriptural meditation to focus and relieve stress. Additionally, chapels, small groups, and Bible-study groups can focus on and integrate spiritual disciplines to help reinforce this training. Mwangi (2017) notes, "Small group discipleship ensures continuous perspective transformation through the self-regulated catalytic encounters resulting from the practice of spiritual disciplines" (p. 353).

Conclusion. Transformative formation ultimately requires a posture of daily submission of the moral, spiritual, emotional, and intellectual capacities of students to the Lordship of Christ, developing character virtues and postures, and practicing spiritual disciplines can help sustain this posture (CCCU, 2010; Mulholland, 2016; PBS, n.d.; Vang & Carter, 2013; Wax, 2011).

Transformational Pedagogy

Chan (2008) states that transformational pedagogy means setting up classroom assignments for critical reflection and creating spaces for meaningful dialogue in the classroom. The New Testament church practiced transformational pedagogy through listening, processing, and applying the apostles' teaching (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37). This teaching was grounded in the life of Jesus, the life of the apostles, the power of the Holy Spirit in their lives, and their application of God's truth.

Classroom Pedagogy. Professors should spearhead this effort by having course assignments and experiences that encourage critical thinking, challenge assumptions, foster group interactions, develop networks of learning, bridge the gap between real world and classroom experience, utilize learning covenants, integrate thoughtful reading assignments, provide meaningful content, ensure faith and learning integration, utilize engaging teaching methods, provide field experiences, value and encourage diverse thinking and diversity, and maintain ideal conditions for reflective discourse to occur (Decker, 2017; Mwangi, 2017; Ntamushobora, 2012; Tran, 2011; Wollert, 2003). The aspects that hindered transformational pedagogy included teaching inconsistency, unproductive assignments, sharing only one perspective, a lack of concern for students, a lack of integration of faith and learning, and a lack of professor experience and expertise (Chan, 2008; Tjioe, 2012). The following 15 major dualisms in Western Christianity require integration if believers are going to lead holistic lives, and professors need to assist with these dimensions in transformational pedagogy:

> Four metaphysical dualisms (sacred/secular, eternal/temporal, spirit/matter, heaven/earth), two anthropological dualisms (soul/body, spirit/flesh), four epistemic dualisms (faith/reason, fact/value, head/heart, freedom/authority), and five ethical-political dualisms (private/public, belief/behavior, individual/community, church/state, Christ/culture). (Naugle, 2004, p. 12 as cited in Esqueda, 2015)

Additionally, CHEI leaders can create programs derived from the key constructs of thriving, which can help students participate academically, set SMART (specific, measurable, attainable, realistic, and time-bound) goals, be more aware, be open to dissimilarities, and create a climate of belonging and ownership (Richardson, 2017). All these aspects can occur within a freshman seminar, but also need to be integrated into the broader curriculum. Barkley (2017) noted that the following positive spiritual pedagogy

related outcomes that students tremendously appreciated included help in understanding God's love, applying Scripture to life's situations, and finding meaning and purpose in something larger. The learning environment should challenge, unpack, and strengthen the faith of students (Ntamushobora, 2012). Faculty can also learn from the early church and church fathers in terms of how they formed disciples while being a cultural and religious minority that was subject to persecution. Learning from the global church can also be tremendously helpful, as they generally struggle with persecution and have to teach believers how to be faithful in the midst of it; this is noble and noteworthy and is worth emulating and integrating.

Faculty should also use pedagogical and andragogical methods to facilitate transformative learning, in addition to strategically integrating technology to enhance learning. These can include but are not limited to: presentations, journaling, demonstration of formation processes, field trips, utilizing the arts and symbols, encouraging students to participate in worship services with church traditions different from their own, and learning from missionaries and global Christians. No matter what method is used, students should always be provided a practical and tangible way to apply these concepts. Faculty should also model appropriate authenticity and vulnerability by sharing their life stories. Transformational pedagogy should incorporate formal and informal assessment to ensure that students are being holistically formed.

A "rule of life," could be taught, modeled, and utilized within the framework of a freshman seminar, integrated into the curriculum, and constantly updated throughout the student's college journey. A "rule of life" is a compilation of rules for daily living that applies to every facet of an individual's life; it sets and maintains God as the center and

reason for everything an individual does and helps keep the individual's life in balance (Farrington, 2000, p. 4).

Theological Training Model. Many churches lack clear ways of forming people and, consequently, there exists a "sanctification gap" (Lovelace, 1979). The goal of Spiritual Formation is to provide space for the sanctification process to occur. Coe's (2000) "theological training model" can address the sanctification gap because it requires "intentionalizing faith and training in righteousness" at CHEIs through reimagining each course as a spiritual discipline (as a procedural means) and integrating spiritual disciplines across the curriculum by both "methodological" (integrating classical spiritual disciplines in development, teaching, and assignment creation) and "teleological" means (bringing out the spiritual significance and application of the course content through a prayer project, devotional reflection, soul work about class application, or service to church or community) (p. 95). Coe (2000) encourages institutions to provide intentional opportunities for the Spirit of God to engage in teaching and learning within the classroom framework, resulting in the Holy Spirit's work being "existentially actualizable" in the lives of the students (p. 104). A key resource in this domain, to assist faculty, is the *Journal of Spiritual Formation and Soul Care*, which can help unpack this model and also provides practical ways to apply this and other models.

Steps for Transformation. Transformational pedagogy also involves teaching students about looking to Jesus as the model for Spiritual Formation and what it looks like to live a godly life on this earth by daily depending on the Holy Spirit, listening to the Father, and exercising faith and trust in God (Issler, 2012). Anointed teaching is required for life change (Reimer, 2016). An anointed teacher is not merely a gifted

teacher but one who has believed and lived out the teachings of Christ and, through it, has gained spiritual authority to proclaim the word of God (Reimer, 2016). Willard's (2002) "VIM" model can be a powerful tool to assist with transformation: Vision of the life in the kingdom, Intention to be a kingdom person that requires a decision, and Means to accomplish this task (p. 85). Issler's (2012) four steps, "Awake, Admit, Ask and Act", could be modeled and taught by faculty as a mechanism for transformation to occur. Awakening means being aware of the problem, admitting means confessing the problem to God and others, asking means requesting God for help to deal with the issue, and, finally, acting involves finding tangible ways to deal with the issue (Issler, 2012). Mwangi (2017) notes that, within the context of small groups, sharing meaningful biblical content in conjunction with sharing and discussion with peers and leaders on a regular basis was critical to understanding, processing, and integrating transformational pedagogy.

Identity. Satan is constantly challenging God's character (Genesis 3:4-5), wisdom (Gen 3:5), and word (Genesis 3:1), and tempting humankind to give in to temptations of the "lust of the flesh, lust of the eyes, and the pride of life" (1 John 2:16). Transformational pedagogy teaches students to stay rooted in their identity in Christ by having their needs for acceptance, security, and significance met in Christ and through godly community (Terpstra, 2017). The centrality of God's love cannot be overlooked, as it is indispensable for formation. Faculty need to teach students that Jesus is the one who began the process of formation, and He is the one who ultimately brings it to completion at His second coming (Philippians 1:6). One of formation's critical goals is to deal with soul issues, resist temptations, and overcome trials by following Jesus's example.

Some of the key themes that CHEI leaders and faculty need to be aware of and students need to address include:

> The key learning themes concerning student's self-concept were: a realization of human sinfulness and finiteness, a new self-understanding as socialized beings, personality development, finding and defending one's identity, becoming adult, and becoming a critical thinker. Student's image of God transformed in the areas of: God's unconditional love, balancing God's responsibility and human's responsibility, God's sovereignty and trustworthiness, and God's empowerment through the Holy Spirit. The students especially noted behavior and attitude changes in their relationship with themselves, God, and other people, and changes in their approach to ministry. The life expressions of students' transformation could be seen as successful integration of two opposite poles, the poles of openness and boundaries and the poles of power and limitations. (Weinski, 2006, p. 293-294)

Transformation of the Mind. Moreland (2012) argues that the mind "is the soul's primary vehicle for making contact with God" (p. 79). Romans 12:2 challenges believers - "Do not conform to the pattern of this world, but be transformed by the renewing of your mind." Knowledge deficiencies can have detrimental effects on formation, such as limiting one's understanding and interpretation of specific facts or situations, skewing the overall viewpoint on life and the world, and, ultimately, leading to instability (Willard, 2009 as cited in Thomas, 2017). Formation of the mind requires answering the following five questions: "What is reality?; Who is well-off or blessed?; Who is a truly good person?; How does one become a genuinely good person?; and How do we know which answers to the [previous] four questions are true?" (Willard, 2009, pp. 55–56). CHEI leaders need to answer these questions, and faculty need to consistently address these questions within their respective disciplines. Additionally, these questions should be addressed regularly in co-curricular settings such as chapels, small groups, etc.

Addressing Soul Issues. John Calvin, in *The Institutes of the Christian Religion,* claims that, "Nearly all wisdom we possess, that is to say, true and sound wisdom,

consists of two parts: the knowledge of God and of ourselves" (*Inst*. I.1.i). Knowledge of

God is critical in conjunction with self-awareness that leads to deep formation and

dependence on God. Transformation only happens when believers are moved beyond

surface level repentance to deep repentance (that leaves no room for regret and is a

byproduct of Godly sorrow), which also requires asking deep introspective questions

such as, "Why did this sin attract the believer? How can the believer weaken the grip of

this sin in my life? How can the believer invite Jesus to be my sanctifier in this process?"

(Terpstra, 2017). Within this framework, CHEIs should also resist the urge of moral

formation and focus on soul-level formation.

Seven key principles for soul transformation that need to be taught in Spiritual

Formation include having the believer's identity rooted in Christ, repenting before God

and confessing before others, overcoming family sin patterns, asking for and granting

forgiveness, healing soul wounds, overcoming fears, and being delivered from demonic

influence (Reimer, 2016). Transformational pedagogy involves teaching students to live a

faithful lifestyle through passionately pursuing God, living a lifestyle of purity and praise,

praying biblical prayers, being grounded in the promises of God, walking faithfully

through tests and trials, and persisting in doing good and walking with God (Reimer,

2013). Reimer (2013, 2016) argues that transforming the soul to be more like Christ

requires believers to go through suffering well, grieve well, listen to God, listen to others,

and practice spiritual disciplines. As suffering is inevitable in life, believers need to be

taught to follow Jesus faithfully through suffering in order to build character and trust in

God. Suffering has the potential to create barriers in the soul, with self, with others, and

with God. Consequently, these issues need to be addressed in a Spiritual Formation class

or a separate class needs to be created in CHEIs that addresses soul issues, as well as emotional and relational health. Spiritual Formation classes might also benefit from having a counselor come in to do group sessions or even requiring students to go to 5-6 counseling sessions to process unresolved life issues. There are several good resources that can be highlighted in this category, but Robert Reimer's (2013) book *Soul Care* and Peter Scazzero's book *Emotionally Healthy Spirituality* (2017) are good places to begin.

Christian Worldview. Weinski (2006) notes that, for Christians, a unique Christian worldview and a thriving relationship with the Creator were critical to their Spiritual Formation. Transformational pedagogy helps students discern, from a Christian worldview, regions of congruence, complement, tension, or regions of conflict based on what they are learning (Langer, 2012). This integration should be a standard process in every discipline. Every faculty member should be trained in Christian worldview integration and discipline-specific integration. The *Christian Worldview Integration Series,* published by IVP and edited by J.P. Moreland and Francis Beckwith, can be a good starting place for incoming faculty in this process. A second resource is the Spectrum Multiview book series published by IVP Academic, which offers multiple perspectives on critical topics where there is disagreement. This series will help faculty be aware of nuanced views related to their respective disciplines and encourage them to be respectful of different perspectives while simultaneously holding on to Biblical truth. CHEI leaders should also encourage faculty to publish in integration-focused journals. Faculty could also co-teach a class to help with faith integration; this could mean having both a theology professor and a discipline-specific professor co-teaching and learning

from each other, while also simultaneously enhancing student thinking and critical reflection.

      Spiritual Formation within Scripture Narrative. Spiritual Formation requires an understanding of the meta-narrative of Scripture (Creation, Fall, Redemption, and Consummation), places itself between the Redemption and Consummation phase of this narrative, and is inextricably tied to the character and heart of God as demonstrated in this narrative (Wax, 2011; Brent & Curtis, 2011). Spiritual Formation teaches believers to live in the scriptural narrative of a salvation here, but not yet, world (Briones, 2020; Shaw, 2018). Also, inextricably tied to this narrative is the fact that formation places itself within the framework of God's heart, God's character, God's wisdom, and His unrelenting love for humanity (Curtis & Eldredge, 1997; Wax, 2011). The rebellion of humanity in the Garden of Eden causes breaks in four types of relationships and plays itself out in the rest of scripture narrative. These relationships are: (1) the human being with self; (2) the human being with God; (3) the human being with other humans; and (4) the human being with nature (Wax, 2011; Ward, 2016). Spiritual Formation should help appropriate the benefits of Jesus's resurrection into the life of the believer and the four relationships. Students should be taught about key theological concepts related to Spiritual Formation, such as salvation, appropriation, regeneration, sanctification, justification, etc. Transformational pedagogy involves integrating this meta-narrative of Scripture, along with the implications of what Jesus did on the cross and applying the process of sanctification in every class.

      Sozo (σῴζω)**.** This Greek word means to "save, deliver, restore, heal." The supernatural worldview is a necessary prerequisite for holistic formation and for an

accurate understanding of biblical theology (Keener, 2012-2015; Moreland, 2007). Jesus came to proclaim salvation, freedom, physical healing, inner healing, and deliverance (1 John 3:8; Luke 4:18-19; Matthew 8:16-17; MacNutt 2009). The life of Jesus is testament that God performs supernatural signs and wonders. Jesus preached the gospel, healed the sick, cast out demons, raised the dead, and did several nature miracles (Matthew 8:16-17; Luke 4:18-19; Keener, 2011). Healing and deliverance occurred several times in the gospel accounts and Acts (Keener, 2012-2015). Transformational pedagogy involves helping students understand the power, love, and truth of the gospel. CHEI leaders need to create an expectancy and space for the supernatural to occur. Faculty also need to regularly demonstrate an expectancy in the classroom setting for Jesus and the Holy Spirit to interact with students through physical healing, inner healing, and deliverance. Chapels need to create spaces for God to touch students supernaturally, in addition to having trained spiritual directors and campus pastors available for the students.

Formation for Mission. Jesus's mission was to destroy the works of the enemy (1 John 3:8; Luke 4:18-19). According to Paul's letter to the Ephesians, the three domains from which evil in the world stems are the human body (the body and mind that are constantly warring against God), the world (systems in the world that work against God's kingdom), and the Kingdom of Darkness (Arnold, 1997, p. 36). Believers are constantly at war with the Kingdom of Darkness (Satan and his demonic forces). Students need to be taught about the fact that there is a devious supernatural evil that is constantly at work and instructed on how to counter this evil darkness by following Jesus. The believer's mission is to walk in the authority of Christ to bring change and transformation to the world and to counter the forces of darkness (Mark 16:16-20; Luke 10:1-23).

Formation takes place for the sake of others (Mulholland, 2016). Miller (2007) affirms this by stating that the critical goal for church and seminary education is to increase love in the student for both God and neighbor. CHEIs need to train believers about their role in reconciling the world to God through sharing Jesus with the world and making disciples (Matthew 28:18-20; 2 Corinthians 5:17-20). The goal of Spiritual Formation is to prepare students to be on God's mission and to do the good works that God commissioned believers to do before the beginning of time (Ephesians 2:10; Matthew 28:18-20).

Spiritual Formation also requires teaching about vocational discipleship as a means to living out God's mission, "knowing and living God's calling, especially in the arena of work, and right-sizing our ambitions to God's purposes" (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 143). This means students should be prepared to be centered on God in their thinking about work and calling, should desire to do vocation with integrity, and should believe that God designed them for a unique calling (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 146). Vocationally forming students also means orienting them around the mission of God by helping them believe and see God's work in the world, teaching them about how to utilize their faith to make a difference, and giving them a passion to serve God's world (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, pp. 179–181).

Barkley (2017) affirms that adult students tremendously valued the following spiritual outcomes: vocational and career direction, meaning and purpose bigger than themselves, and assistance with using strengths and gifts for God's Kingdom. Ntamushobora (2012) notes that the reason behind transformation was to help others encounter perspective changes and for community service. Ntamushobora (2012) also

noted that perspective transformation in students resulted in superior skills to complete job-related tasks well and to assist their neighborhoods. Discipline-specific classes at the junior and senior level or the graduate level should keep this holistic perspective in mind to ensure that vocational Spiritual Formation is occurring. CHEI leaders and faculty need to ensure that this focus is central in shaping students. The idea of calling needs to be integrated into this teaching, along with assistance to form the student's ministerial identity (i.e., all students are ministers of the Kingdom of God). The college and career center should provide venues and forums during which key vocational leaders in different fields are regularly invited to demonstrate how they are integrating their faith into their work and how "engaging in countercultural mission means living as a faithful presence by trusting God's power and living differently from cultural norms" (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 178).

Cultural Discernment. Transformational pedagogy should involve teaching disciples about cultural discernment. Digital Babylon is constantly trying to shape young adults with access to excessive formative media (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). This means that discipleship requires training with thoughtful reflections from a diverse community of Christians both locally and globally. Cultural discipleship must provide students with wisdom for "how to live faithfully in 'a secular world,' with people who think differently about sex and sexuality, how to deal with finances, and technology" (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 74). Faith communities need to become learning communities that help with instilling and transmitting knowledge through deep teaching and learning in action (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). Barkley (2017) noted students tremendously valued the ability to see how to apply Scripture in specific situations. CHEI

curriculum should involve cultural discernment and practical theology classes that address "hot" topics in culture. CHEIs are best positioned to accomplish this unique mission and should do so. Professors should also be willing to engage thoughtfully in cultural issues, and faculty promotion and tenure committees should allow for publication in the editorial sections of newspapers to contribute to promotion and tenure. Additionally, faculty symposiums should be held on complex cultural topics to help students, faculty, and CHEI leaders reflect on and integrate these topics from the framework of a Christian worldview.

Diversity and Diverse Perspectives. Transformational pedagogy should also factor in the unique perspectives brought by women, minorities, international students, and culturally diverse students. Transformation occurs in a classroom climate that fosters safe inquiry, interactions, and reassurance of the goals articulated by women and minorities (Barkley, 2017, Wade, 2004). It is also critical to train faculty members about the unique experiences of women and minorities (Wade, 2004). Faculty also need to respect diverse faith traditions, especially in schools that are non-denominational or that have an open enrollment policy. Faculty should help students think critically about religious beliefs and traditions. This also presents students the opportunity to engage graciously with their peers on complex religious doctrines (Tweedell & Hall, 2016). Diversity-related training should be carefully grounded in a scriptural understanding of diversity. Faculty could also co-teach classes to bring in diverse perspectives.

Praxis. From a practical standpoint, Mwangi (2017) notes that transformational pedagogy involved both faith foundations and pertinent skills (included both life skills and skills for ministry). Tran (2011) notes that successful integration of practical skills

occurred through students working at a ministry site that helped by providing multiple perspectives, integration focus, and intrinsic expectations. The importance of having praxis integrated into a class cannot be overstated. CHEI leaders need to ensure that students have ample opportunities for praxis, which might include but are not limited to service learning opportunities, internships, and in-ministry training. Whenever possible, comprehensive internships (requiring an on-site mentor with thoughtful work to help students develop degree- and career-related skills) need to be integrated within the graduation requirements. Field experiences are so critical to formation and so faculty should be encouraged to incorporate them whenever applicable (Tjioe, 2012). For instance, a comparative world religions class could be a great opportunity for students to go on a field trip to local religious sites or faculty could invite religious leaders to come to class and share about their religious traditions. Students can then be provided an opportunity to respectfully engage with these leaders in a Q&A forum. For a Spiritual Formation class, faculty could do site visits to Catholic monasteries and different Christian church services to help students see the depth and scope of Christian traditions. Praxis could also involve doing prayer walks in the neighborhood, serving the community, etc.

   Online Learning. From an online transformational learning perspective, creating environments that foster online community is essential, in conjunction with utilizing "instructional design that emphasizes all levels of interaction (student-content, student-student, student-teacher) in their courserooms" (Woodson, 2010, p. 177). Tran (2011) reaffirms this concept, stating that "cognitive presence, social presence and teaching presence" were indispensable to transformative learning (p. 6). Online transformative

learning occurred primarily through class assignments and classroom interactions

(Woodson, 2010; Tran, 2011). Individuals played critical roles in transformation

(Woodson, 2010; Tran, 2011). Woodson (2010) shares the following strategies for faculty

to stimulate transformation online: (a) Assignments that challenged worldviews; (b) daily

or weekly prayer request collection through discussion boards; (c) connecting with

students to develop personal relationships (d) debates or daily or weekly devotional based

discussion; (e) using thoughtful movies to stir discussion on challenging topics; (f) asking

students to engage weekly by either posting a devotional or subject related discussion

question; and (g) engaging students by offering mentoring even after the course ends.

Assessment. Sweet (2012) suggests that Christian accrediting agencies and

associations should clearly and comprehensively articulate "what is being assessed and

then [provide] helpful and valued resources toward achieving that end" (Sweet, 2012, p.

174). Assessment strategies for Spiritual Formation need to be comprehensive, which

involves mixed methods and a broad array of campus stakeholders. Some of the most

common ways to assess Spiritual Formation included student interviews, Spiritual

Formation courses, assessment instruments, and capstone courses (Sweet, 2012).

Additionally, the Spiritual Transformation Inventory is an outstanding instrument for

assessing Spiritual Formation.

Conclusion. Faculty members act as spiritual guides who help with critical

thinking, challenge assumptions, foster class interactions, maintain an environment for

transformative learning, and bridge the gap between the real world and classroom

experience. That they do so successfully is quintessential for transformational pedagogy

(Wollert, 2003; Woodson, 2010; Tran 2011). Transformational learning is not a random

occurrence. Transformational pedagogy occurs through intentional program set-up and design that is aimed at transformative learning (Woodson, 2010; Tran, 2011). This means CHEI leaders should evaluate both curricular and co-curricular activities to ensure alignment with transformative learning principles. It is important to note that transformational pedagogy functions holistically only in the framework of transformational spaces, events, activities, and relationships.

CHEI leaders need to engage faculty in developing the previously described principles, attitudes, and skills, and these should be integrated across the curriculum. Faculty also should also be intentional about receiving training about how to enhance their teaching in order to integrate principles for transformative learning within the classroom context. Faculty also need to be regularly evaluated by Department Chairs, Program Directors, or Deans to ensure that these principles are integrated in the classroom. In order to ensure deep integration, interdepartmental collaboration is pivotal and needs to be fostered from the top down. Additionally, faculty evaluation forms and course evaluations need to be updated to check for the integration of transformational pedagogy principles. Lastly, faculty promotion should also be tied to excellence in transformative pedagogy in order to ensure consistency institution-wide.

Transformational Spaces

Chan (2008) defines "transformational spaces" as both "physical and metaphorical spaces" that create the space for transformational activities (p. 147). This section will focus on physical spaces that are linked to transformation, as online "spaces" linked to transformation were previously described under the section for transformational pedagogy. Transformational spaces, in addition to the classrooms and general college

environment, included college dorms, faculty offices, faculty homes, internship sites, and churches (Tjioe, 2012). Ma (2003) noted that residential students tended to benefit more from formation opportunities when compared to commuters. Additional transformational spaces included prayer rooms, counseling rooms, spiritual director rooms, and chapel spaces. Tjioe (2012) noted that the dormitory (learning to live in diverse community, respect for others, and seeing the lives of others) and church (pastoral support and scriptural teaching) were central for formation. Integrative experiences for distance learning students are critical to formation and these spaces could be internship or ministry sites (Wollert, 2003). Students were inspired by testimonies and this could be regularly integrated at chapels and classrooms to create and foster transformative spaces (Tjioe, 2012). Some deformative dimensions in terms of transformative learning, specifically as it pertains to dormitories, included the rules not being communicated well and unpleasant responses from those in authority (Tjioe, 2012). From the New Testament church standpoint, transformational spaces included the meeting spaces of temple courts and homes (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37). The very act of opening up one's home to others and trusting others demonstrated deep commitment and trust in the early church, which, in turn, afforded opportunities and spaces for transformative formation to take place.

CHEI leaders need to be aware of the impact of transformative spaces. CHEI leaders need to rethink every campus space in light of its potential for transformative learning. This could mean putting signs, Scripture verses, and Christian images across the campus space. This could also mean that the design of buildings and internal space needs to intentionally and visibly demonstrate the purpose of that space. The mission, vision, and values statements of institutions could be placed in prominent locations across

campuses. Every space can be turned into sacred ground where God can encounter students, staff, and faculty. Faculty should pay careful attention to messaging in their offices and to the arrangement of furniture to ensure that students experience a warm and comfortable environment. This holds true for counseling centers and other staff offices as well. Prayer rooms and chapels should be designed with this concept in mind so that students have the opportunity to use all of their senses to engage with God. Scriptures can be integrated into buildings or buildings can be named after Christian alumni, along with their testimonies integrated in a visible location. The potential for these concepts are endless. CHEI leaders and student development staff can learn from liturgical and orthodox Christian traditions to have a better understanding of what this means and how to incorporate symbols, art, rituals, and scents into the worship experience.

However, the most important dimension of transformational spaces is not per se the space, as the space is inanimate in and of itself. Chan (2008) notes that faculty office space was associated with transformational relationships with faculty while dorm space was associated with transformational relationships with peers. Chan (2008) also noted that there was a transformational "metaphorical" space referred to as "home" - a space where students felt a sense of belonging while away from home and was associated with "their friends and classmates as family, and their major or certain groups of friends" (Chan, 2008, p. 133). The key concept being that these transformational spaces outside the classroom afforded the opportunity to build or develop transformational relationships (which will be discussed in the next section), which aided with transformative learning.

Transformational Relationships

Human beings were created for community and the Trinity exists in continuous community (Saucy, 2001). Chan (2008) defines transformational relationships as ones that embody and demonstrate "authenticity, love, connectedness and commitment" (p. 147). Tjioe (2012) expands on this list by adding "engagement in dialogue and respect for diversity" (p. 115). Spiritual Formation is highly relational in nature (Shepson, 2010; Sweet, 2012). Several key types of relationships are mentioned in this section as being impactful in transformation. These include the Trinity, staff, faculty, peers, intergenerational relationships, and family relationships.

Transformational relationships in the New Testament church context involved daily fellowship and communion that united believers as the body of Christ. These believers lived lives of radical generosity; were united; and fellowshipped with God, each other, and the apostles on a daily basis, which played a major role in their transformation (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37). Communities and relationships within communities help believers learn, grow, pass on the faith, mentor, disciple, minister, and serve others, both inside and outside the church. The community of believers can only be formed through "interaction, sharing, communication, corporate prayer, community story and connectedness of life together" (Strawn & Brown, 2013, p. 14).

One key concept guiding many of these types of relationships was a mentoring dimension. Shepson (2010) discovered that mentoring had a tremendous influence on student Spiritual Formation, specifically within the following four categories: (a) connecting to others, (b) educational methods, (c) influence of prayer, and (d) attachment. Mentoring also offers students an opportunity to imitate mature believers in Christ, which is critical for formation (Strawn & Brown, 2013). Mwangi (2017) notes that guidance and

dialogue with discipleship leaders was a positive influence. CHEIs can tremendously benefit by integrating intentional mentoring at all levels throughout the institution. One way to achieve this is to ensure that the student has at least one mentor, whether the mentor is church-based, or parachurch based, or from within the institution. These mentors should be paired based on student need, and it would benefit the student and the mentor to come up with tangible goals for the mentoring relationship (this can include Spiritual Formation goals in conjunction with leadership development or a skill development or the integration of faith and learning within a particular discipline).

Mentoring can be setup in the following sequential manner. Freshman and sophomores or first-year graduate students could be assigned a mentor, and, ideally, this mentor should be integrated into the classroom setting (perhaps within a small group in a Spiritual Formation class for at least an hour per week, in addition to encouraging meetings outside of class time). Juniors/Seniors or second-year graduate students should have an educational mentor in their respective discipline. The second-year mentoring can be for Spiritual Formation and for the development of skill sets necessary to thrive within the ministry context/discipline that the student is serving in or planning to serve in. Final year students should, ideally, be mentored and also act as a mentor to incoming freshmen or first-year graduate students. Ideally, these requirements could be integrated within Spiritual Formation or similar classes. These mentors do not all have to be from the CHEI, but can be from church, parachurch, or other Christian ministries.

In addition to mentoring, CHEIs can offer services that include pastoral care, inner healing, deliverance, counseling, and spiritual direction to assist with deep levels of

transformation, whenever this is financially possible. They could also partner with outside Christian agencies that offer these services.

CHEIs shouldn't be an end in and of themselves in terms of relationships and mentoring. This is because, at some point, students graduate from the college. Consequently, in addition to on campus relationships, students need to be plugged into their local church. To this end, when students transition to college, they can be connected with Bible studies either on or off campus, partnered with parachurch ministries, and continue to maintain their connection with their home church to ensure the task of solidifying faith.

Trinity. CHEI leaders and faculty need to have and model a deep and thriving relationship with the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit. God is the initiator of formation (1 Thessalonians 5:23). This means believers need to have a right relationship with God, the Father; Jesus, the Son; and the Holy Spirit. This should be a fundamental guiding principle of all curricular and co-curricular activities, and the essence of everything a CHEI does. Reimer (2016) argues that life change begins alone in the presence of God, and that when "we (believers) give him access to our hearts, He will do an inner work of transformation" (KL 239). Connectedness with God involved students experiencing:

> God's involvement in their transformation as they encountered truths in the Bible and sensed God and the Holy Spirit giving them understanding about how those truth should shape their perspectives; when God gave them qualities such as self-control to resist negative peer pressure; and as God gave them the strength to adjust their perspectives (Mwangi, 2017, p. 265).

God the Father, and Jesus, the Son. Without an understanding of the love of God the Father, the formation process fails (Jang, 2018). Jesus serves as the model for formation (for CHEI leaders, faculty, and students) and demonstrated daily dependence

on the Holy Spirit, listening to the Father, and exercising his own faith and trust in God (Issler, 2012). The life of Jesus is "[the believer's] example in aspects of our common humanity as regenerated members of God's family (e.g., humility, forgiving from the heart)" (Issler, 2012, KL 1331-1332). Consequently, experiencing intimacy with Jesus is a prerequisite for formation. This relationship begins at salvation and continues during the sanctification process. Resilient disciples are those who seek to worship and experience God, and they "feel" close to Him. Students need to carve out time for "hearing from, listening to, and talking with God," and they should understand that discipleship requires intentionality and thoughtfulness (Kinnaman and Matlock, 2019, p. 64). An experiential relationship with Jesus should impact every region of every CHEI member's life. Additionally, generally speaking, strong affective transformation (joy, satisfaction, peace, etc.) should naturally occur as the disciple regularly engages with Jesus (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019). So, faculty members need to teach students to listen to God's voice and experience his intimacy. This concept needs to go beyond theological doctrines. Students need to be presented with opportunities in curricular and co-curricular activities to engage with God and to talk to Him about their learning. A good starting place for learning about and applying this concept for CHEI leaders, staff, faculty, and students is the book by Dallas Willard (2012) entitled *Hearing God: Developing a Conversational Relationship with God.*

Holy Spirit. The Holy Spirit is the initiator of transformation by providing deep revelation that transforms students and subsequently enables them to help others navigate perspective transformation and serve in new ways (Ntamushobora, 2012). Fee & Ingram (2004) noted that the Holy Spirit played a major role in well-being, including both

religious well-being and existential well-being. The Holy Spirit is central to the sanctifying process and, by extension, to the Spiritual Formation process (Issler, 2012). The Holy Spirit teaches, sanctifies, comforts, seals, indwells, encourages, and empowers the believer to be like Jesus (John 14:26; John 16:13; 1 Corinthians 6:11; Issler, 2012). The Holy Spirit also matures the believer through the fruits of the Holy Spirit (Galatians 5: 22-23). The empowerment of the Holy Spirit helps in four crucial domains for students, each of which needs to be taught and demonstrated. These are: (a) Strengthening their relationship with God, (b) for Christ-like life, (c) for emerging collectively into a thriving and mature Christian group, and (d) for ministry within the group and to outsiders (Issler, 2012, KL 1345-1347).

The Holy Spirit provides gifts and manifestations to the believer for the sake of the church (Romans 12:3-8; 1 Corinthians 12, 14). The gifts are for serving the church (Romans 12:4-8; Schroeder, 2007). Schroeder (2007) argues that every believer has at least one gift for ministering to the church and for the building up of the church. These gifts include such things as: administrator, exhorter, empathizer, prophet, giver, teacher, and server. Additionally, there are several manifestations of the Holy Spirit, as described at length in 1 Corinthians 12 and 14 (Schroeder, 2007; Keener, 2011). The gifts and manifestations of the Holy Spirit help the believer in the sanctification process by shaping them with purpose and direction (Schroeder, 2007). These gifts also help the believer with serving, encouraging, and empowering God's people (Schroeder, 2007). The church also has positions for the building up of the church, which include apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors, teachers, overseers, and deacons (Ephesians 4:11; 1 Timothy 3:1-3). These gifts and manifestations should be taught about in CHEIs.

Additionally, opportunities should be provided for tangibly practicing and utilizing these gifts within the context of CHEIs.

Faculty. Transformational faculty relationships played a major role in the formation process. These included relationships with professors who were role models, demonstrated sincere concern, viewed students as whole persons, intentionally engaged inside and outside of class relationships, and desired to help students (Chan, 2008; Tjioe, 2012). Faculty function as spiritual guides (Wollert, 2003). Faculty members should serve as role models and be willing to serve students as appropriate (Tjioe, 2012). Conversely, faculty members who didn't demonstrate a godly character, were inconsistent, and were unwilling to form close relationships with students, created de-transformative experiences (Tjioe, 2012). Adult students, minority students, and female students tremendously valued faculty relationships (Barkley, 2017; Decker, 2017; Wade, 2004).

Since this is so central to student formation, these relationships cannot be overlooked. It might be helpful to offer mentoring training for faculty members and to strongly encourage faculty members to mentor students as part of their contractual obligations. Since faculty mentoring has tremendous benefits, it should be something that should be strongly encouraged, measured, and even integrated as a requirement into the faculty promotion process. Faculty should also be trained in integrating faith and learning so they can be role models in their respective disciplines. Faculty can have meals with students, pray with students, mentor students, etc. to help built transformational relationships.

Staff. Barkley (2017) noted that relationships with staff and administration at Christian institutions were highly regarded by students. Student support services played a central role in formation (Ma, 2003; Tuttle, 2000). Staff should be trained to offer a customer-centered relationship, be reminded that they are there to serve the students, be required to embody the core values of the CHEI, and be willing to pray for students as needed. Student development staff play a major role in being present for students and ensuring that students receive the appropriate services. Other dimensions of staff relationships have been discussed in other sections.

Peers and Cohorts. The communal experience occurring as part of theological education was critical to ministerial formation (Wollert, 2003)**.** Transformative peer relationships included both giving and receiving guidance and support. The key dimension that positively impacted peer relational quality was sharing life experiences (Tjioe, 2012). A dimension that countered formation was a lack of spiritual friends (Tjioe, 2012). Mwangi (2017) notes that transformative relationships form students through companionship (an element potentially unique to non-western contexts), positive peer influence, peer accountability, and authenticity. Peer relationships tremendously impact students, have a positive impact on their spiritual lives, provide educational support, and play a vital role in transformation (Barley, 2017; Tuttle, 2000; Ma, 2003). Discipleship groups were highly valued at CHEIs (Ma, 2003).

CHEI leaders and student development staff need to be intentional about creating spaces for peer relationships to occur organically and programmatically. Classes should provide opportunities for students to work in groups so they can form deeper friendships. Cohort communities, especially for adult students, have been demonstrated to help

students with graduation and thriving and should be implemented whenever possible. Cohort communities might also benefit from having at least 2-3 designated student roles, such as a cohort chaplain and a cohort leader. Whenever possible, students should have a degree completion plan that aligns with that of their peers who entered the institution at the same time, to ensure the natural formation of relationships. Additionally, faculty advisors can also lead or facilitate student peer/cohort groups as these students navigate their college journey together.

Church and Intergenerational Relationships. Kinnaman & Matlock (2019) challenge the church to go from bigger to smaller as transformation takes place in small groups and homes. Research supports that resilient disciples have a church they belong to, individuals in their life who encourage them to grow spiritually, a supportive community of believers, respect for the faith of their parents, a close connection with people at church while growing up, and an emotional connection with at least one person in their church (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 112). Spiritual Formation requires building integral relationships at the local church, in addition to having intergenerational relationships. Intergenerational relationships means having relationships with church attendees who are younger and/or older, in addition to relationships within the student's peer groups. Spiritual Formation also requires teaching students about being both a mentor and mentee simultaneously and balancing the use of digital tools to grow relationships instead of inhibiting them (Kinnaman & Matlock, 2019, p. 131).

Family. The impact of families in transformation needs no explanation. Families engaged in religious practices and activities were significantly more likely to have better relationships with each other than families that are not as engaged in religious practices

(Smith & Kim, 2003). Family religious beliefs played a major role in the formation of youth (Smith & Kim, 2003). Parents were influential in the lives of students attending Christian colleges (Barna Group, 2017; 2018). The other relationships that influenced students included sibling, spouse, friend, or teacher (Barna Group, 2017). Additionally, supportive parents played a major role in transformation of students who were enrolled in college while also going through challenging circumstances (Tjioe, 2012). CHEIs can encourage students to share and process things learned in class with parents, siblings, and other family members to aid the process of transformative learning. Additionally, CHEI leaders could offer general tips to parents on how to support students in their academic journey so transformative learning can occur; this concept holds especially true in non-western nations where familial bonds are intricate and run deep.

Conclusion. Kinnaman and Matlock (2019) encourage believers to do the hard work to get relationally healthy and whole in order for transformation to take place. Transformational learning can occur through all of the following relationships – God, peers, peers in ministry, friends, graduates, mentors, church leaders, parents, staff, and professors (Shepson, 2010; Chan, 2008; Wollert, 2003; Woodson, 2010; Mwangi, 2017; Ntamushobora, 2012). Consequently, CHEIs should design and carry out programs institution-wide that promote the growth of healthy, transformative relationships.

Transformational Activities

Tjioe (2012) defined transformational co-curricular activities as different "activities related to campus life that had either positively or negatively impacted students' transformation" (p. 355). Transformational activities fell into two main categories, which included support groups that fostered non-academic activities and

Spiritual Formation activities (Tjioe, 2012). A key aspect that played into every component was the university's obedience to God's word (Tjioe, 2012). From the New Testament church's standpoint, transformational activities included communion, eating together, worshipping and seeking God together daily, and sharing wealth (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37). These united the early church members together in ways that were spiritual and transformational.

Chapels. Chapels play a critical role in formation (Ma, 2003; Tuttle, 2000). Many CHEIs require them as part of the college experience. In order to factor in the changing demographics (increase in commuter and adult students), it might be more helpful to offer convenient times for chapels. Chapels should fall under the purview of the Chief Spiritual Development Officer and should be designed to reinforce key ideas of Spiritual Formation and transformative learning. Chapels can have many foci, which may include: Teaching and preaching God's word, responding to God's word, worship chapels, chapels that focus on reflection, chapels focused on spiritual disciplines, interactive chapels that help students engage and participate in the service, testimony chapels, chapels with messages from Christian leaders and thinkers, listening chapels, guided prayer chapels, liturgical chapels (which can incorporate prayer rhythms and submission to God through liturgy), consecration chapels, etc.

Missions. Missions trips can be transformational activities as they enable students to develop: deeper contentment/appreciation of blessings and freedoms, a better understanding of how they fit into God's plan, a deeper trust of God in hardship and for small details, more passion for the lost, and more specific prayers and an increase in time spent in prayer (Tuttle, 2000). Tuttle (2000) notes that deeper levels of transformation

were also associated with good pre-field training and debriefing after the trip. Consequently, CHEIs should strive to integrate local and global missions trips as part of their curriculum and co-curriculum. Designating a student development officer to partner with a local or global missions agency could help with this process. Opportunities for local and global missions trip should be strongly encouraged and required (whenever possible). CHEIs should also be intentional about serving the local community through service projects, and this should be integrated throughout the curriculum and co-curriculum as a mechanism to teach students to practice service, grow in leadership, and be spiritually formed.

Retreats and Conferences. Student retreats and conferences can also assist with helping students detach from their current settings and engage with God. These provide transformative experiences if done correctly. Retreats can have a teaching component but should also always offer spaces for experiential encounters with God. Retreats can also be themed around some of the concepts mentioned in this study that play a major role in formation, like spiritual renewal, spiritual disciplines, etc.

Student Groups. Student groups played a major role in Spiritual Formation, and these include peer support, cohort groups, clubs, Bible study groups, support groups, etc. This was previously described under transformational relationships and in several other sections.

Other Activities. Some of these activities included the university choir, a thoughtful student orientation week, Bible study groups, theology classes, group projects, devotions, and assemblies (Tjioe, 2012). Additionally, cafeteria spaces can be setup to encourage students to intentionally engage with each other and practice community.

Transformational Events

Transformational events and transformational emotional events played an indisputable role in formation, but these events varied between the traditional college-aged population and the post-traditional adult population. In both populations, they could be categorized best as disorienting dilemmas and could occur both inside and/or outside the classroom (Chan, 2008; Tjioe, 2012; Decker, 2017). From the New Testament church standpoint, transformational events included God's supernatural grace that came upon His people, the regular (if not daily) empowering and transformative work of the Holy Spirit, persecution, and supernatural signs and wonders performed by the apostles that caused the church and local community to be in awe of God's work (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37).

Transformational emotional events included unexpected acts of kindness, divine intervention, and physical touch as a sincere demonstration of love (Tjioe, 2012). These emotional events are critical because human beings are not just "thinking beings" but "embodied actors" (Strawn & Brown, 2013). For context, emotions need to be understood as not just inward experiences; they are "continuous brain-body adjustments and attunements to our current situation and most particularly our social situation" (Strawn & Brown, 2013, p. 12).

Chan (2008) notes that transformational events, though rare, had the most impact on transformational learning and "are crisis events that bring basic assumptions about oneself and the world under examination" (p. 147). Crisis (comprehended in the classical Eriksonian sense) is a key faith development driver. These crises or cognitive dissonances comprise everything that confronts individuals and forces them to examine

what they believe and why they believe it. The primary ways this occurred were: prolonged exposure to diverse ways of thinking, extensive multicultural exposure, and general emotional crisis (overlaps exist between the first two) (Holcomb and Nonneman, 2004).

CHEIs have a moral impetus to help students process through a crisis event so they can develop life skills, not fall into cynicism or depression, and get the most out of their college experience. Ma (2003) suggests the incorporation of counseling centers into colleges and universities, to help students' process through crisis. Spiritual directors, chaplains, and faculty mentors could assist with this process as well. Sharing the steps involved in transformative learning and grieving loss could help students' process through crisis experiences. Campuses could have student support groups to address various types of crises or concern and integrate the cohort communities' model to ensure that every student has the necessary support. Cohorts might benefit from having a student chaplain to ensure that every cohort member gets prayed for regularly. These student chaplains, whether present in cohorts or available to the general student body, should be offered training and mentoring and maybe a small stipend to help them engage holistically in this process. Smaller CHEIs could also partner with local churches or parachurch ministries in the vicinity to offer support for students who are dealing with physical, social, or emotional crises. Faculty should also regularly pray for students, inquire about prayer requests at the start of class, and create prayer and peer groups as often as is appropriate. Online classes can accomplish this by use of breakout groups, which accomplish the same purpose. Every chapel should also offer a safe space for students to respond, receive prayer, and should have a chaplain present for pastoral

counseling. Campuses might also benefit from having prayer rooms available to help students process deep pain with God.

Tjioe (2012) notes that "divine interventions" played a major role in transformation. Two types of divine interventions will be discussed below, which include divine encounters and spiritual renewal.

Divine Encounters. The exponential rise of Pentecostal and Charismatic denominations across the globe, as documented by several church and secular historians, is directly related to the spiritual transformation of individuals and to the supernatural works done by the Holy Spirit (Noll, 2013). Even a cursory reading of Acts demonstrates that the Holy Spirit played a major role in the massive growth and expansion of the church. Jones (2013), through his research, discovered that a divine encounter causes significant impact in the lives of individuals, many of whom made major life changes and even chose to move into full-time ministry after the experience (Jones, 2013). Participants experienced divine encounters in several ways, including, "Encounter during impartation time, visitation from the Lord, angelic visitation, deliverance, prophetic declaration, or a dream" (Jones, p. 163-164). Sherri (2016) documents affective, cognitive, and behavioral transformation as byproducts of divine encounters.

CHEI leaders need to be aware of these ideas. CHEI leaders and faculty need to create spaces for students to be open to divine encounters with God. There should be a culture of expectancy built throughout campuses so students can experience the imminent presence of God. Acts demonstrates that the church was able to advance the Kingdom of God because of the mighty move of the Holy Spirit. In fact, the apostles were transformed after receiving the Holy Spirit in Acts 2, which led to a dynamic change in

their ministry. CHEI leaders who are training future spiritual leaders for the world can no longer rely on a western-based, anti-supernatural, and non-experiential gospel. Transformed students who walk with God and His Spirit are God's disciples for bringing hope and change in this world.

　　　Spiritual Renewal. CHEIs need to teach, train, and provide fertile ground for revivals to occur, as revivals cause tremendous life and societal change even several years after the phenomenon occurs (Bissett, 2009; Collier, 1995; McLaughlin 2015). The Great Awakening and other seasons of spiritual renewal have transformed the larger American religious landscape and theological education in several positive ways, including but not limited to creating tremendous spiritual hunger, generating passion for righteousness, inviting people to care for social justice causes, leading to repentance, drawing people to humility, inviting people to study the word of God, increasing world missions, etc. (Orr, 1994; Gleason, 2002; Anderson and Towns, 1998). Revival can cause a deep passion for people and invite them to pursue God and practice spiritual disciplines (Collier, 1995).

　　　Bissett (2009) notes three key factors for revival. The first factor for revival was prayer and fasting, passion and desire for God, earnest expectation for revival, God working through outside world events, impact of staff and curriculum, and finally prolonged chapels in conjunction with unique revival-type meetings. The second factor was a burden for the spiritual condition of campus, which included concern over a loss of Christ being the center, sin, and campus constituents' apathy towards God and the things of God. The third factor was the providence of God, which included conviction from the Spirit of God, a supernatural desire for holiness and unity, vulnerability, repentance,

confession, and reconciliation (p. 633). Campus leaders need to study these revival dimensions, while faculty need to teach and model these within classroom contexts. They also need to encourage student leaders across campuses to come together to pray for revival and set up groups to pray for revival. Chapel speakers need to share about revival whenever possible.

McLaughlin (2014) suggests several ways to teach on, and create a culture of, revival at CHEIs. His dissertation and appendices provide several useful tips on how to create and sustain a culture of revival. The numerous books written by James Edwin Orr, a scholar and preacher of true revival, can also be great resources for those wishing to explore this topic further (Anderson and Towns, 1998; Gleason, 2002; The Books Written by J. Edwin Orr, n.d.).

Conclusion. Without forming resilient disciples shaped by revival and transformative encounters with God, the church and CHEIs will ultimately fail. God needs to move supernaturally in the lives of campus leaders, staff, and faculty. Additionally, CHEIs need to recover their first love and passion for God through being holistically devoted to Him.

Transformative Learning in Diverse Populations

The transformational learning process slightly differed for minorities and other cultural groups. Wang (2015) notes that, for Asian students enrolled in a graduate program, transformative learning occurred in the following steps: (1) A disorienting dilemma occurred in the form of students encountering their limitations when it came to ministering to others, internal struggles, and challenges to culture; (2) Self-examination occurred through a reexamination of a student's upbringing in a hierarchical context in

addition to Asian parenting and church culture; (3) A critical assessment of assumptions took place through wrestling with suppositions about self, others, and God; (4) Recognition of one's discontent took place through being transformed within the framework of community (meek and authentic faculty, nonjudgmental cohorts, and compassionate spiritual directors); (5) Exploration of a new role, relationships and/or actions took place through establishing a transformed relationship with God, self, and others; and (6) Acquiring knowledge and skills for implementing one's plan took place through "double knowledge", "theorization of spirituality", and experiential training in the spiritual disciplines (p. 253).

Tweedell and Hall (2016) note that adult African American students preferred face-to-face classes, which enhanced transformation, with religion and relationships being crucial factors for them (Tweedell & Hall, 2016). Interestingly, even the few students who were not openly Christian stated that religion was an important factor for them in choosing to attend the respective institution (Tweedell & Hall, 2016). The adult degree completion programs from which the participants were interviewed affirmed minority students as spiritual beings who were cared for, loved, and part of God's plan (Tweedell & Hall, 2016). African American students valued the nurture of their souls and minds, and felt affirmed, refreshed, respected, accepted, encouraged, and valued by faculty members who created a safe environment that enhanced collaboration, who were candid about their own life experiences, and who fostered learning (Tweedell & Hall, 2016). Interactive classes that were applicable to their daily lives of students, which provided additional impetus for degree completion, were also valued (Tweedell & Hall, 2016).

CHEI leaders and faculty need to be aware of these nuances as the minority student population is increasing across campuses. CHEI leaders need to be intentional about hiring diverse staff and faculty as appropriate. CHEI leaders also need to be aware of cultural diversity and create transformative spaces for all students. CHEI leaders need to receive training in terms of increasing diversity and cultural training among staff, faculty, and the student body and they need to learn how to hire people committed to the mission of their CHEI. Faculty need to be provided training to engage cross-culturally and with diverse student groups.

Summary of the Study

The review of the literature in this study demonstrated that integrating transformative learning into CHEIs for the purpose of enhancing Spiritual Formation has the potential to offer tremendous benefits. The study identified three major gaps that pertain to Spiritual Formation at CHEIs and demonstrated how to address these gaps. The gaps are: The lack of a proper and comprehensive definition for Spiritual Formation that is utilized consistently across CHEIs, the lack of holistic methodologies used for implementing Spiritual Formation institution-wide, and the lack of comprehensive Spiritual Formation assessment (CCCU, 2010). CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty should be trained to utilize the methods and findings from this study to assist with spiritually forming students.

CHEI leaders, staff, and faculty should be encouraged to integrate TLT whenever appropriate and as it is biblically and theologically congruent. Transformation occurred in three dimensions: "(a) psychological, (b) convictional, and (c) behavioral" (Robert, 2009, pg. 90). Transformative learning in CHEIs was understood to be "a complex personal

change process where cognitive, emotional, evaluative, social, and spiritual processes worked together" (Weinski, 2006). Transformation specifically at CHEIs occurred through (a) transformational relationships, (b) transformational spaces, (c) transformational pedagogy, (d) transformational posture, (e) transformational activities, and (f) transformational events. Transformational learning within CHEIs has both a divine element and physical presence component. Chan (2008) states that transformational postures permit students to engage in transformational pedagogy by entering transformational relationships and spaces, where they encounter the work of the Holy Spirit in their lives. From a theological integration standpoint, each of these six ideas were involved in the formation of the New Testament church (Acts 2:42-47; Acts 4:32-37).

This study explored strategies for utilizing transformative learning principles to spiritually form students within CHEIs. However, as previously mentioned, more studies with larger samples are still needed in order to validate the findings of this study. Also, further studies are needed in order to try to answer inquiries related to the best ways of integrating transformative learning and Spiritual Formation in CHEIs among different student population.

REFERENCES

Association of Biblical Higher Education. (2020). *ABHE facts.* http://www.abhe.org

Association of Biblical Higher Education. (2024). *ABHE facts.* http://www.abhe.org

Anderson, N., & Towns, E. (2019). *Rivers of revival.* Destiny Image.

Arnold, C. (1997). *3 crucial questions about spiritual warfare.* Baker Books.

Astin, A. W., Astin, H. S., & Lindholm, J. A. (2011). Assessing students' spiritual and religious qualities. *Journal of College Student Development, 52*(1), 39-61. Johns Hopkins University Press. Retrieved July 20, 2019, from Project MUSE database.

Barkley, H. R. (2017). *Adult learners and spiritual formation: Exploring outcomes at Christ-centered universities* (Publication No. 10265282). [Doctoral dissertation, Regent University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1889556936). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/adult-learners-spiritual-formation-exploring/docview/1889556936/se-2?accountid=8624

Balzer, C., & Reed, R. (Eds.). (2012). *Building a culture of faith: University-wide partnerships for spiritual formation*. Abilene Christian University Press.

Barna Group. (2017). What's next for biblical higher education: How Bible colleges can prepare for the church's future. Barna Group.

Barna Group. (2018). What's next for Christian higher education: How Christian colleges & universities can prepare for the church's future. Barna Group.

Bissett, N. K. (2009). *Wesleyan perfectionism in revivals of the 19th and 20th centuries at Wheaton College and its impact on institutional identity* (Publication No. 3365633). [Doctoral dissertation, Regent University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305137177). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/wesleyan-perfectionism-revivals-19-sup-th-20/docview/305137177/se-2

Briones, D. (2020, August 4). *Already, not yet: How to live in the last days.* Desiring God. https://www.desiringgod.org/articles/already-not-yet

Bromiley, G. W. (Ed.). (1979–1988). *The International Standard Bible encyclopedia, Revised*. Wm. B. Eerdmans.

Calhoun, A. A. (2015). *Spiritual disciplines handbook: Practices that transform us.* IVP Books.

Chan, G. (2008). *An exploration of the transformative learning experiences of college seniors at a southern California Christian university* (Publication No. 3308530). [Doctoral

dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1810164722). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/d issertations-theses/exploration-transformative-learning-experiences/docview/1810164722/se-2?accountid=8624

Coe, J. (2000). Intentional spiritual formation in the classroom: Making space for the spirit in the university. *Christian Education Journal,* 4NS, 85–110.

Collier, P. B. (1995). *The significance of the Asbury revival of 1970 for some aspects of the spiritual lives of the participants* (Publication No. 34056930). [Doctoral dissertation, Asbury Theological Seminary]. ecommons ATS Dissertations https://place.asburyseminary.edu/ecommonsatsdissertations/94/

Council for Christian Colleges & Universities. (2010). *CCCU report on spiritual formation (CCCU Monograph Series).* https://www.cccu.org/professional_development/resource_library/2011/cccu_report_on_s piritual_formation

Council for Christian Colleges and Universities. (2020). About CCCU. http://www.cccu.org.

Council for Christian Colleges and Universities. (2024). About CCCU. http://www.cccu.org.

Council for Christian Colleges and Universities and Econsult Solutions. (2018). Building the economy and the common good: The national impact of Christian higher education in the United States. https://www.cccu.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/CCCU-National-Impact-Final-Report-12.12.17.pdf

Curtis, B., & Eldredge, J. (1997). *Sacred romance.* Thomas Nelson.

Decker, A. (2017). *Adult learners' experiences in accelerated degree-completion programs at Christian colleges: Transactions and transformations* (Publication No. 10257566). [Doctoral dissertation, Asuza Pacific University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1896678923). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/adult-learners-experiences-accelerated-degree/docview/1896678923/se-2?accountid=8624

Dirkx, J. (1997). Nurturing soul in adult learning. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education,* 74, 79-88. https://msu.edu/~dirkx/DIRKX.CHP.htm

Dirkx, J. (1998). Transformative learning theory in the practice of adult education. *PAACE Journal of Lifelong Education,* 7, 1-14. http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://search.proquest.com/docview/1810435034?accountid=8624

Edwards, T. H., Jr. (1980). Spiritual formation in theological schools: Ferment and challenge. *Theological Education, 77*(1). 7-52.

Esqueda, O. (2015). Biblical worldview: The Christian higher education foundation for learning. *Christian Higher Education*, *13*(2), 91–100. https://doi-org.ezproxy.biola.edu/10.1080/15363759.2014.872495

Farrington, D. (2000). *Living faith day by day: How the sacred rules of monastic traditions can help you live spiritually in the modern world.* Berkeley Publishing Company.

Fee, J. L., & Ingram, J. A. (2004). Correlation of the Holy Spirit questionnaire with the spiritual well-being scale and the spiritual assessment inventory. *Journal of Psychology & Theology, 32*(2), 104–114.

Foster, R. (2012). *Celebration of discipline: The Path to spiritual growth.* Hodder & Stoughton.

Glisczinski, D. J. (2007). Transformative higher education. *Journal of Transformative Education*, *5*(4), 317–328.

Higher Education Research Institute (HERI). (2003). *The spiritual life of college students: A national study of college students' search for meaning and purpose – executive summary*. https://spirituality.ucla.edu/docs/reports/Spiritual_Life_College_Students_Full_Report.pdf

Holcomb, G., & Nonneman, A. (2004). Faithful change: Exploring and assessing faith development in Christian liberal arts undergraduates. *New Directions for Institutional Research*, 122, 93-103.

Holy Bible: New International Version. (2011). Zondervan.

Issler, K. (2012). *Living into the life of Jesus: The formation of Christian character.* IVP Books.

Jang, J. (2018). *The relationship between intentional father involvement and intergenerational transmission of Christian faith among evangelical Presbyterian families in South Korea* (Publication No. 10839358). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (2085942191). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/relationship-between-intentional-father/docview/2085942191/se-2

Jones, T. (2013). *Divine encounters: Analysis of encounters that shape lives* (Publication No. 3579927). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1517975155). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www-proquest-com.ezproxy.biola.edu/dissertations-theses/divine-encounters-analysis-that-shape-lives/docview/1517975155/se-2?accountid=8624

Gleason, M. (2002). *When God walked on campus: A brief history of Evangelical awakenings at American colleges and universities.* Joshua Press.

Keener, C. (Ed.) (2011). *Miracles: The credibility of the New Testament accounts* (Vols. 1-2). Baker Academic.

Keener, C. (Ed.). (2012–2015). *Acts: An exegetical commentary* (Vols. 1-4). Baker Academic.

Kinnaman, D., & Matlock, M. (2019). *Faith for exiles: 5 ways for a new generation to follow Jesus in digital Babylon*. Baker Books.

Langer, R. (2012). The discourse of faith and learning, *Journal of Education and Christian Belief, 16* (2), 159-177.

Lovelace, R. F. (1979). Dynamics of spiritual life: An Evangelical theology of renewal. InterVarsity Press.

Ma, S. Y. (2003). The Christian college experience and the development of spirituality among students. *Christian Higher Education Journal, 2*(4), 321-339.

MacNutt, F. (2009). *Deliverance from evil spirits: A practical manual.* Chosen Books.

McLaughlin, R. J. (2014). Exploring the conceptual compatibility of transformative learning theory in accounts of Christian spiritual renewal at Wheaton College in 1995 (Publication No. 3619147). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1530480658). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/exploring-conceptual-compatibility-transformative/docview/1530480658/se-2?accountid=8624

McLaughlin, R. J. (2015). Exploring the conceptual compatibility of transformative learning theory in accounts of Christian spiritual renewal at Wheaton College in 1995. *Christian Education Journal*, *12*(2), 333–354.

Mezirow, J. (1991). *Transformative dimensions of adult learning.* Jossey-Bass.

Mezirow, J. (2000). Learning to think like an adult: Core concepts of transformative theory. In J. Mezirow, & Associates (Eds.), *Learning as transformation: Critical perspectives on a theory in progress.* Jossey-Bass.

Miller, G. (2007). *Piety and profession: American Protestant theological education, 1870-1970.* Eerdmans.

Moreland, J. P. (2007*). Kingdom triangle: Recover the Christian mind, renovate the soul, restore the Spirit's power*. Zondervan.

Moreland, J. P. (2012). *Love your God with all your mind: The role of reason within the life of the soul.* NavPress.

Morris, J. M., Smith, A. B., & Cejda, B. D. (2003). Spiritual integration as a predictor of persistence at a Christian institution of higher education. *Christian Higher Education*, *2*(4), 341. https://doi-org.ezproxy.biola.edu/10.1080/15363750390246105

Mwangi, M. W. (2017). *Perspective transformation through small group discipleship among undergraduate university students in Nairobi, Kenya* (Publication No. 10268965). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1916585545). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/perspective-transformation-through-small-group/docview/1916585545/se-2?accountid=8624

Naidoo, M. (2011). An empirical study on spiritual formation at Protestant theological training institutions in South Africa. *Religion & Theology*, *18*(1-2), 118-146. doi:10.1163/157430111X613692

Naugle, D. K. (2004, June). Renewing integrity: A Christian worldview and educational practice. Paper presented at the meeting of the National Faculty Leadership Conference, Washington, DC.

Noll, M. (2013). *The new shape of world Christianity: How American experience reflects global faith.* IVP Academic.

Ntamushobora, F. (2012). *From transmission to transformation: An exploration of education for holistic transformation in selected Christian and public universities in Kenya* (Publication No. 3529538). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1810435267). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/transmission-transformation-exploration-education/docview/1810435267/se-2?accountid=8624

Orr, J. E. (n.d.). The Books Written by J. Edwin Orr. https://jedwinorr.com/book-list/

Orr, J. E. (1981). The re-study of revival and revivalism. School of World Mission. http://jedwinorr.com/Orr_Revival_and_Revivalism.pdf

Otto, P., & Harrington, M. (2016). Spiritual formation within Christian higher education. *Christian Higher Education*, *15*(5), 252–262. https://doi.org/10.1080/15363759.2016.1208594

Pazmino, R. W. (2010). Christian education is more than formation. *Christian Education Journal,* 7(2), 356-365.

PBS. (n.d.). Imago Dei ("image of God"). https://www.pbs.org/faithandreason/theogloss/imago-body.html

Piper, J. (2011). Desiring God. *Meditations of a Christian hedonist* (rev. ed). Multnomah.

Railsback, G. L. (2006). A demographic description of Evangelicals attending secular and Christian colleges. *Christian Education Journal,* Series 3, *3*(2), 278-302.

Reimer, R. (2013). *Pathways to the King: Living a life of spiritual renewal and power*. Carpenter's Son Publishing.

Reimer, R. (2016). *Soul care: 7 transformational principles for a healthy soul*. Carpenter's Son Publishing.

Richardson, R. G. (2017). *A thriving minority: Pathways to success for religious minority students attending Christian institutions of higher education* (Publication No. 10602627) [Doctoral dissertation, Asuza Pacific University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1992171220). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/thriving-minority-pathways-success-religious/docview/1992171220/se-2?accountid=8624

Roberts, N. A. (2009). *The role of spirituality in transformative learning* (Publication No. 3377924). [Doctoral dissertation, Florida International University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305132619). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/role-spirituality-transformative-learning/docview/305132619/se-2?accountid=8624

Schroeder, D. (2007). *Walking in your anointing*. Author House.

Schroeder, D. (2013). *Follow me*. Xulon Press.

Scott, S. L. (2017). Christian leadership emergence and ministry development as influenced by divine encounters (Publication No. 10037647). [Doctoral dissertation, Fuller Theological Seminary]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1775429958). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/christian-leadership-emergence-ministry/docview/1775429958/se-2?accountid=8624

Shaw, D. (2018, April 08). The already and not-yet kingdom https://au.thegospelcoalition.org/article/already-not-yet-kingdom/

Shepson, D. R. III. (2010). *Transformational learning theory and Christian college students in the Southeast: A study of faculty mentoring and relational spiritual formation* (Publication No. 3448369). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1810170806). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/transformational-learning-theory-christian/docview/1810170806/se-2?accountid=8624

Smith, C., & Kim, P. (2003). *Family religious involvement and the quality of parental relationships for families with early adolescents: A research report of the national study*

of youth and religion. http://www.youthandreligion.org/publications/docs/family-report2.pdf

Strawn, B. D., & Brown, W. S. (2013). Liturgical animals: What psychology and neuroscience tell us about formation and worship. *Liturgy*, *28*(4), 3-14. doi:10.1080/0458063X.2013.803838

Sweet, P. R. (2012). *The perceived effectiveness of strategies for assessing spiritual formation at Christian colleges and universities* (Publication No. 3547900). [Doctoral dissertation, Columbia International University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1282375739). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/perceived-effectiveness-strategies-assessing/docview/1282375739/se-2?accountid=8624

Thomas, C. L., & Cohen, H. L. (2006). Understanding spiritual meaning making with older adults. *The Journal of Theory Construction & Testing 10*(2), 65-70.

Thomas, B. (2019). *Spiritual formation: A survey of freshman at a Christian institution of higher education* (Publication No. 22583112) [Doctoral dissertation, Southeastern University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (2273838461). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/spiritual-formation-survey-freshmen-at-christian/docview/2273838461/se-2?accountid=8624

Thomas, N. (2017a). [Review of the book *Knowing Christ today: Why we can trust spiritual knowledge* by Dallas Willard]. *Christian Education Journal, Vol. 14, No. 1.*

Thomas, N. (2017b). [Review of the book *Love your God with all your mind: The role of reason within the life of the soul (* 2nd rev. ed.) by J. P. Moreland]. *Christian Education Journal, Vol. 14, No. 2.*

Thomas, N. (2019). [Review of the book *Three passions of the soul: A deep and transforming reorientation of the soul* by Bruce Terpstra]. *Christian Education Journal, Vol. 16, No. 2.*

Thomas, N. (2021). [Review of the book *Faith for exiles: 5 ways for a new generation to follow Jesus in digital Babylon* by David Kinnaman and Mark Matlock]. *Christian Education Journal, Vol. 18, No. 2.*

Tisdell, E. J. (2003). *Exploring spirituality and culture in adult and higher education* (1st ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Tjioe, G. (2012). *Transformative learning experiences of juniors and seniors at a school of education in a Christian university in Indonesia* (Publication No. 3529535). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (1810435034). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-

theses/transformative-learning-experiences-juniors/docview/1810435034/se-2?accountid=8624

Tran, N. (2011). *Transformative learning in online theological education. A case study of an online program at a theological seminary* (Publication No. 3486515). [Doctoral dissertation, University of North Texas]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (909937153). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/transformative-learning-online-theological/docview/909937153/se-2?accountid=8624

Tuttle, K. A. (2000). The effects of short-term mission experiences on college students' spiritual growth and maturity. *Christian Education Journal*, *4*(2), 123-140.

Tweedell, C., & Hall, H. (2016). Persistence of African Americans in faith-based adult programs. *Biblical Higher Education Journal*, 11, 47 – 62

Vang, P., & Carter, T. G. (2021). *Telling God's story: The biblical narrative from beginning to end* (3rd ed.). B&H Academic.

Wade, D. H. (2004). *Perspective transformation among female reentry students at an evangelical Christian university* (Publication No. 3160062). [Doctoral dissertation, Colorado State University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305205841). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/perspective-transformation-among-female-reentry/docview/305205841/se-2?accountid=86

Wang, (2015). Impact of spiritual formation and transformative learning at a North American seminary in the lives of Chinese students (Publication No. 27738999). [Doctoral dissertation, Biola University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (2383607250). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/impact-christian-spiritual-formation-program-on/docview/2383607250/se-2?accountid=8624

Ward, M. (2016). *Biblical worldview: Creation, Fall, Redemption*. (M. L. Ward Jr. & D. Cone, Eds.). BJU Press.

Wax, T. (2011). *Counterfeit gospels: Rediscovering the good news in a world of false hope*. Moody Publishers**.**

Weinski, M. (2006*). An inquiry into the transformative learning of evangelical theological students in Germany* (Publication No. 3221678). [Doctoral dissertation, Trinity International University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (304937006). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/inquiry-into-transformative-learning-evangelical/docview/304937006/se-2?accountid=8624

Welch, R., & Mellberg, K. (2008). Spiritual maturation and religious behaviors in Christian university students. *Christian Higher Education, 7*(2), 142–161. https://doi-org.ezproxy.biola.edu/10.1080/15363750701283573

Willard, D. (2002). *Renovation of the heart: Putting on the character of Christ*. NavPress.

Willard, D. (2009). *Knowing Christ today: Why we can trust spiritual knowledge*. Harper Collins.

Wollert, M. H. (2003). *Transformative learning and faith development in graduate seminary students* (Publication No. 3119316). [Doctoral dissertation, University of Tennessee]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305307326). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/transformative-learning-faith-development/docview/305307326/se-2?accountid=8624

Woodson, S. K. (2010). *Cura personalis in online undergraduate Christian higher education* (Publication No. 3390690). [Doctoral dissertation, Capella University]. ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global. (305242791). http://ezproxy.biola.edu:80/login?url=https://www.proquest.com/dissertations-theses/i-cura-personalis-online-undergraduate-christian/docview/305242791/se-2?accountid=8624